

Mark of Toledo
Intellectual Context and Debates between Christians and
Muslims in Early Thirteenth Century Iberia



Edited by
Charles Burnett & Pedro Mantas-España

UCOPress

CNERU – The Warburg Institute

CNERU – The Warburg Institute

Serie Arabica Veritas

4

Chief Editors

Charles Burnett • Pedro Mantas España

Advisory Board

Alexander Fidora • Dag Nikolaus Hasse • José Meirinhos

David Nirenberg • Rafael Ramón Guerrero

Mark of Toledo. Intellectual Context and Debates between Christians and Muslims in Early Thirteenth Century Iberia. – Córdoba : UCOPress. Córdoba University Press – CNERU (Córdoba Near Eastern Research Unit) – The Warburg Institute (London), 2022

Edited by Charles Burnett – Pedro Mantas-España

(Serie Arabica Veritas; vol. 4)

ISBN : 978-84-9927-667-0

Edit: UCOPress. Córdoba University Press
Campus Universitario de Rabanales
Ctra. Nacional IV, km. 396
14071 – Córdoba, Spain

<http://www.uco.es/ucopress>
ucopress@uco.es

Print: Imprintatecé, S.C.A.
Ingeniero Torres Quevedo, s/n
Córdoba (Spain)

Cover design by Manuel Marcos-Aldón and Juan Pedro Monferrer-Sala

ISBN: 978-84-9927-667-0

DL: CO 56-2022

© UCOPress

© CNERU



Research Project IPGC2018-096807-B-I00
'Greek-Arabic and Latin Biblical and Patristic Manuscripts'

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, translated, stored in any retrieval system, nor transmitted in any form without written permission from the Publisher

Printed in Spain

The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife: A work from late 12th-century Iberia

Introduction, Edition, and Translation

Nicola Polloni – KU Leuven

Charles Burnett – The Warburg Institute

Literary production from medieval Iberia incessantly provides modern historians with remarkable accounts of its multicultural landscape.¹ Such accounts often expand on detailed aspects of the lively discussions among Iberian communities that speak different languages (Romance languages, Latin, Hebrew, Arabic), follow different cults (Christian, Jewish, and Islamic religions, differently specified in the peninsula), and live in different geographical areas whose borders were fluid and political systems not uniform. Quite often, medieval Iberian texts directly engage with discussions of central tenets of this intercultural encounter. In some cases, their aim is to produce specific theoretical knowledge to be employed by their community of reference. That new knowledge can be scientific, theological, or philosophical in nature. It can offer criticism of the others' stances and traditions or plead for an opening to those positions. In either case, these texts are characterised by their willingness to discuss, understand, and assess 'the other' by acknowledging a specific (yet sometimes unspoken) epistemic gain that can be produced by that encounter.

The translated text that follows this brief introductory study is an invaluable witness of such intercultural and interdisciplinary blend that characterises medieval Iberian literature. The text does not have a title in its only extant manuscript. It does not have an acknowledged author either, because the manuscript witness does not ascribe it to anyone. Moreover, this text does not seem to have had any remarkable influence on the philosophical and theological debate of that time. These limitations should not diminish its value. After all,

¹ This contribution is the result of a close collaboration between its two authors and should be considered organically as a unitary whole. Nonetheless, Nicola Polloni was primarily responsible for the introduction, Charles Burnett for the edition, and both equally for the English translation of the text.

originality and ingeniousness cannot be assessed by measuring the number of references to a text or the influence on other historical actors. In the remainder of this introduction we shall try to address briefly the first two limitations.

Marie-Thérèse D'Alverny first shed light on this treatise with an article published in 1942 in which she offered a transcription of the text. We shall refer to this text as *The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife*.² The treatise indeed discusses the destiny of the human soul after being severed from the body at the time of death. A short scrutiny of the threefold ways in which 'human' can be said (namely, in reference to the outer, inner, and composite human) gives way to the author's detailed description of the dispositions of the inner human. This is the human soul that, together with the body (the outer human), composes the human being in her earthly life (the composite human). The treatise focuses on the soul only and addresses just one question: what happens to the human soul living an eternal spiritual life after the death of the body?

The first step in the author's argumentative strategy is to distinguish among three kinds of dispositions proper to the soul. They are named right, left, and middle dispositions, respectively. These three dispositions mirror those of the body, which can be either healthy, or sick, or neutral. Analogically, the soul, too, can follow her righthand disposition and live a blessed and happy life. Or she can follow her left disposition and enter a process of misery and suffering. The treatise follows these two lines of possible futures for the soul, detailing three lists of ten degrees of happiness, regions of beatific ascent, and punishments to the damned soul, respectively. As we are going to see, the repetition of sets of ten items in each list is linked to the soul obeying or disobeying the Ten Commandments.

The first list details the degrees of happiness that the soul can achieve once it is separated from the body if she follows her righthand disposition. Hierarchically ordered, these degrees are also a sort of process of 'epistemic transmutation' for the soul. The process is twofold. With the first six degrees, the soul gradually enjoys complete rule over her psychological powers that were once hindered by the body. Consequently, the soul becomes what she actually is. She can 'operate anything she wants over this bodily corruptible world' (first degree) and has 'firm knowledge of whatever is below' (second degree). She 'is

² Marie-Thérèse d'Alverny, 'Les Pérégrinations de l'âme dans l'autre monde d'après un anonyme de la fine du XII^e Siècle', *Archives d'Histoire Doctrinale et Littéraire du Moyen Âge* 13 (1942), pp. 280-299. Reprinted in *Études sur le symbolisme de la Sagesse et sur l'iconographie*, Aldershot: Vivarium, 1993, article V.

pleased with herself and her works' (third degree) and has a complete awareness of herself knowing 'both in herself and in others all the impressions and images of all things thought, said, and done' (fourth degree). The fifth degree corresponds to the true rest of the soul that does not need anything else, while in the sixth degree 'the soul is made identical to herself as regards to what she wants, has, and can do.' While the first six degrees of happiness are all related to the soul's own delight in her consideration of her past and present actions, the last four degrees correspond to a gradual acquisition of new intellectual content and delight from God. First, the soul perceives intellectually 'the flux of light proceeding from the divine essence' (seventh degree). Such light allows the soul 'to be adorned, formed, and shaped by all adornments, forms, and shapes of all substances and accidents both above and below herself' (eighth degree) and to 'cherish those forms, shapes, and all the images that are impressed in herself' (ninth degree). Hence, in the highest degrees of this process, the soul does not only retrieve the full government of her powers, but she also enjoys additional knowledge that is bestowed upon her by God's light and spiritual closeness. The process is crowned by the tenth and last happiness, which is for the soul 'not to comprehend, but apprehend the infinite Being in her own being,' having a direct knowledge of God Himself.

The author connects the ten degrees of happiness to ten 'regions' of being above the rational soul. An evident oxymoron, these spiritual areas correspond to the choirs of angels. Consequently, this second list details the soul's ascent to the angelic choirs in her path towards bliss and delight. The first ascension coincides with the soul's union and assimilation with the Active Intelligence (the *dator formarum* of the Avicennian tradition) and the enjoyment of the first happiness mentioned by the first list. From the second to the ninth regions, the soul joins the angelic choirs and becomes like their angels, delighted by the happiness that they enjoy. Finally, the last degree of ascent is for the soul to join God Himself. The author observes that probably no other human apart from Christ enjoyed such happiness, which corresponds to a direct knowledge of God (tenth happiness) and the complete understanding of the mystery of the Trinity.

During her earthy life, however, the soul can choose a different path. Her left disposition opens a spiritual journey made of torment and sorrow, which are vividly depicted by the list of ten miseries characterising the soul's descent to hell. As in a distorting mirror, the ten miseries reflect in an opposite way the ten degrees of happiness of the righthand disposition. While the latter is characterised by the soul's gradual achievement of a complete government over her powers and dispositions, the former leads to an anarchy in both willing and

knowing. Such a distorting mirror also reverts and distorts the journey of the righthand soul ascending to the angelic choirs into a sorrowful journey through the planets, opposite to those choirs. The left soul descends from the bliss she could have had to the damnation she has earned. With the first misery, the soul becomes unable to perform her operations. She craves for using them but, given her impossibility to do so, she suffers, unable to enjoy the epistemic flow coming from the Active Intelligence from which she is now severed. The second misery adds to this condition. The soul's torment is characterised by (and grounded on) an epistemic failure of her powers. She sees false images of things, vain impressions that enrich her soul with deceit. Such degraded access to the world is accompanied by wrath and ire in the third misery, in which the soul hates and curses herself, weeping. Then, she falls into the darkness of the fourth misery: an epistemic darkness made of the impossibility to experience and know something new while seeing instead only what the soul used to think and say while she was embodied. By reminiscing all that with no possibility to interrupt such flow, the soul finally becomes aware of how detested she is because of her earthy actions.

The fifth misery of the left soul is another step towards epistemic annihilation. The author makes clear that each happiness and misery add on the previous, extending bliss and damnation, respectively, while maintaining what has been given by the previous degree. Hence, while some souls stop at an earlier stage of both journeys, others accumulate either bliss or torment to the very end of their spiritual paths. The fifth misery is the soul's torment for not finding what she wants and needs while ceaselessly looking for it. She cannot have anything, and the sixth misery plays on this lack of possibilities exciting the soul into ever more unsuitable desires that torment her even more. With the seventh misery, the soul realises that she will be deprived forever of the light flowing from God: He will only give her His hatred, 'and she wants to hide from Him, if she could.' She cannot hide nor flee, though: all she can do is to stay exposed to God's wrath in perpetuity. A terrible fate for the soul. Yet, if she were to be condemned to the eighth misery, the soul would suffer even more. The eighth misery is indeed the repetition of all subtleties and concerns of her earthy life by which she craves even more what she cannot have, burning with unsatisfiable desires.

The excruciating journey is crowned by the ninth and tenth miseries. The former corresponds to the soul hating herself and the forms of all existing things. She is eaten by these forms in her mind 'like a moth in clothes or a worm in wood.' She hates both creatures and Creator, all that is good and all that is bad.

The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife

Evidently, she hates existence as such – an existence from which she cannot escape. Such hatred of forms is accompanied by an even greater torture. The tenth misery is based on bodily feelings that the soul can experience again. The soul feels being cremated by fire, suffocated by smoke, frozen by ice, and crushed by stones until she is buried. Suffering these punishments, when the soul burns, she looks for water, when she freezes, she looks for fire. But she cannot have what she desires. And she hopes that some of these tortures will finally end her pain and kill her. But that will never happen: the soul cannot die. In ceaseless unrest, and ‘without hope or confidence in escaping,’ the soul can only suffer – an utter, constant, and perpetual suffering.

The terrible destiny described by the ten miseries could have been avoided: the righthand disposition should always be chosen instead of the left. This is the core of the treatise: both paradise and hell, bliss and damnation are the result of the choices that humans make during their earthy lives. In order to gain paradise and bliss, humans have to follow the Ten Commandments that were ‘known by the just and wisest legislators like Moses, Mohammed, and Christ.’ These three legislators received God’s light and knowledge in their own languages and established religions able to help humankind avoid divine damnation. Following this syncretic religious approach with a spirit typical of medieval Iberia, the author presents the Ten Commandments in both negative and positive ways, that is, according to their prescriptions and proscriptions. Each Commandment is also linked to its specific happiness and misery: by following it, humans gain a specific degree of bliss while, by ignoring it, they gain a specific degree of torment.

A short paragraph explaining the disposition of the middle soul follows the author’s discussion of the Law. What can a soul achieve in the afterlife if she has not been either good or evil? Echoing a middle fate that would be vividly depicted by Dante’s *Purgatory* more than a century later, the author answers that the middle soul will eventually enjoy happiness, although of a lesser degree and after a finite period in which she does not. The reasons proposed by the author to make this point are purely philosophical: every creature ‘tends more strongly towards what conforms to her nature than its contrary, if there are no obstacles.’ Implicitly referring to the Aristotelian framework, the author claims that the soul, being created good and wise by nature, will tend naturally towards what is good and wise. Hence, if there are obstacles hindering such movement, the natural inclination of the soul will not be enough and the human being will have an unhappy destiny in the afterlife, because of her own despicable choices that have violently stopped what tends towards the Good by nature. The treatise is

closed by a final prayer that reconnects to the opening quotation from Psalm XLVIII.

The blending of Islamicate and Latinate cultural references is typical of medieval Toledo and echoes of this attitude can be found in authors like Mark of Toledo. Yet, as we mentioned above, the author of *The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife* is unknown. Given the impossibility to trace the material history of a text with only one manuscript witness, the only conjectures that can be made must be based on the circulation of the Islamicate and Latinate sources used by the author and their original combination within a coherent discourse on the soul. Hence, any hypothesis concerning the authorship of this treatise must rely on two sets of data: the sources used and their interpretation. This is not the right place to propose a thorough examination of the used sources nor to propose a well-grounded hypothesis about the author of the treatise, which needs to be done elsewhere. Consequently, we shall limit ourselves to some remarks on D'Alverny's discussion of the text.

In her study, D'Alverny expands on the sources of *The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife* and their blending. Most of the Islamicate philosophical sources used by the author are works translated in Toledo by Dominicus Gundissalinus and his team. Most prominently, the text was influenced by Avicenna's *Liber de philosophia prima*, al-Ghazali's *Summa theoriae philosophiae*, and Ibn Gabirol's *Fons vitae*.³ The latter is mentioned in *The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife* as 'one of the wisest people,' just before introducing a quotation from *Fons vitae*. These works are accompanied by another Islamicate text of great influence on the Latinate tradition, the *Liber de causis*, whose translation has been ascribed to Gerard of Cremona, another Toledan translator almost contemporary to Gundissalinus.⁴ *The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife* blends these Islamicate sources with sets of quotations from the sacred texts and a few medieval Latinate authors, among whom is also Gundissalinus. In this regard, the structure of the treatise is very close to other treatises from the Toledan translation movement, especially Gundissalinus's *De anima*, where the discussion of Avicenna's and Ibn Gabirol's theories is followed by thick webs of references to Biblical texts with an evident justificatory function of the new sources.

³ See d'Alverny, 'Les Pérégrinations de l'âme,' pp. 240-241.

⁴ On Gerard of Cremona's list of translations, see C. Burnett, 'The Coherence of the Arabic-Latin Translation Programme in Toledo in the Twelfth Century,' *Science in Context* 14 (2001), pp. 276-281.

At the same time, the theoretical (i.e., philosophical and theological) blending of these sources seems to follow Gundissalinus's interpretation of Avicenna's and Ibn Gabirol's cosmologies, combining them into a coherent description of the universe. This approach is remarkably shown by the two diagrams of the universe described by *The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife* that accompanies the treatise in MS Bibliothèque nationale de France, Lat. 3236 A, ff. 89r and 90r (see Figures 1 and 2). Yet similar interpretative lines mark much of the treatise and display the profound influence that Gundissalinus's philosophy had on the author.

Consideration of both the sources used and the theoretical blending characterising the text appears to suggest that the author was linked to Toledo and, more specifically, to Gundissalinus's circle. D'Alverny was aware of this fundamental link to Gundissalinus, as she repeatedly recalls in her study. Nonetheless, she excluded that Gundissalinus might have been the author of *The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife* for chronological reasons.⁵

It is crucial to note that D'Alverny was relying on partial historical sources and the mistaken hypothesis that Gundissalinus was in Toledo during the time of Raymond de Sauvetât's archbishopric, which ended in 1152. Because of this chronological hypothesis, D'Alverny assumed that Gundissalinus's works were written in the first half of the twelfth century, before Gerard of Cremona's translation of the *Liber de causis*. Benefitting from a greater number of historical documents than that available to D'Alverny, recent studies have substantiated a more credible hypothesis about Gundissalinus's biography.⁶ Historical documents from the cathedral chapters of Toledo show that Gundissalinus was in that city at least between 1162 and 1181, when Gerard of Cremona, too, was there. Accordingly, the hesitations that D'Alverny had in connecting *The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife* to Gundissalinus's circle are no longer valid: there are no historical reasons to exclude the possibility that Gundissalinus authored this text. To the contrary, the methodology, sources, and philosophical reasoning adopted by the text seems to point at Gundissalinus or someone in his circle as the most probable author of this treatise. Yet as we said earlier, this

⁵ See D'Alverny, 'Les Pérégrinations de l'âme,' pp. 243-244.

⁶ For an updated discussion of Gundissalinus's biography, see N. Polloni, *The Twelfth-Century Renewal of Latin Metaphysics: Gundissalinus's Ontology of Matter and Form*, Toronto: PIMS, 2020, pp. 1-19.

is not the right place to propose and justify a full-fledged hypothesis about the authorship of the treatise, and we will not proceed further.

Before concluding, we want to point out that our decision to re-edit and translate this text mainly proceeds from a consideration of how this treatise can facilitate a better understanding of the unique cultural environment characterising medieval Iberia. We hope that this translation will help teachers and students to appreciate the ‘creative syncretism’ that characterised the medieval encounter of different cultures, languages, religions, and philosophical traditions. We also hope that by translating the text into English further scholars will duly consider this text and try to disentangle its fascinating and sometimes bizarre framework of theories, sources, and references.

Editors’ note

The following translation is based on the text of MS Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, 3236A, f. 85va-87ra. For the edition the manuscript has been checked again, and some corrections to d’Alverny’s readings have been made. We have also divided the text into sections to help the reader to better navigate it.

Translators’ note

We decided to translate ‘homo’ as both ‘human’ and ‘human being’ following the meaning this term has in the treatise. The author is indeed referring to human beings in general, and not to just males. Accordingly, we have also chosen to refer to ‘humans’ (plural) when the claim has a universal value, even when the Latin text offers the singular masculine term. Finally, in consideration of the universal value of the references to ‘homo,’ we are also using the female pronoun ‘she’ when possible, to underline even more the universal scope of the treatise. The same consideration applies to the rendering of ‘anima’ (soul) as a feminine noun.

Some terms used by the treatise are problematic. For instance, *The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife* refers to the *Liber de causis* and quotes a famous passage in which the difficult term ‘stramentum’ appears. Following Jules Janssens’s recent remarks on this issue, we decided to render ‘stramentum’

with ‘subject’ as to express the meaning of laying below as fundament that seems to have characterized the medieval reading of the *Liber de causis*.⁷

Quotations of Biblical passages are rendered following the economy of the text and not their standard translations. This has been done for two main reasons. First, the *vulgata* version of the Bible available at the time is substantively different from modern editions and, consequently, the reader should not expect to find exact coincidences with the modern version. Secondly, our understanding of the Biblical text and its modern translations have been shaped continuously for centuries through hermeneutical debates and discussions. The best methodological option to avoid falling into the trap of *Zeitabstand* is to just focus on the Latin text without considering how contemporary readers of the Bible may interpret the quoted passage. This choice may affect the rendering of the passage – *absit iniuria verbis*. At the same time, we decided not to make explicit the references to the Biblical passages quoted in the text. They are indeed just one aspect of a thick weave of references to philosophical and theological texts that still needs to be thoroughly assessed. The choice of including Biblical references alone would have misled the reader into the wrong impression that the text is mostly religious, while our interpretation is rather different.

⁷ See J. Janssens, ‘Doubles traductions et omissions: une approche critique en vue d’une édition de la traduction latine du *Liber de causis*,’ in *Reading Proclus and the Book of Causes*, ed. D. Calma, vol. 2, Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2020, pp. 275-316, pp. 291-292.

LATIN TEXT

MS = Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, 3236A, f. 85va-87ra.

A = Marie-Thérèse d'Alverny, 'Les pérégrinations de l'âme dans l'autre monde', pp. 280-99.

<No title>

[1. The inner, outer, and composite human]

Homo, cum in honore esset, non intellexit, cum paratus est iumentis insipientibus, et assimilatus est illis.

Secundum quod sapientum divinorum veterum et modernorum, legalium et philosophorum scripta referre videntur, homo tripliciter dicitur. Nam dicitur homo interior et exterior et ex his compositus. Interior homo, qui et divinus dicitur, non ob hoc dicitur interior quod sit infra aliquod continens conclusus, vel quod superficie comprehendatur, sed quia a sensibus penitus occultatur, et est, ut extimo, ille de quo dicitur: Condelector enim legi Dei secundum interiorem hominem, quoniam lex Dei et observatio mandatorum eius maximam afferunt anime delectationem.

Exterior homo, qui et sensibilis naturalis dicitur, non quod sit extra aliquid aliud exclusum, vel sit continens aliquid aliud infra se, sed quia sensibus manifestatur et ab eis comprehenditur et relaxatur¹; et de /A 281/ isto homine exteriori qui tantum corpus est intendimus, cum dicimus: iste homo est sanus vel eger (eges MS/A), albus vel niger.

Compositus autem homo, qui et dialeticus et predicamentalis dicitur, ex interiori et exteriori stare perhibetur et de isto, ut extimo, dicitur: sicut anima rationalis, et caro unus est homo; et hoc etiam: homo cum in honore esset non intellexit, etc.

Et vere homo in honore factus est, quia quoad corpus meliorem compositionem et temperatiorem complexionem habet, omni compositione et complexione, quo etiam ad animam nobiliori anima omni alia regitur et vivificatur, et de ea dictum est: quia ad ymaginem et similitudinem Dei creatus est et de ea dixit Aristoteles, in *Bonitate pura*: Quia anima nobilis, scilicet rationalis, creatur a Deo mediante intelligentia, et posuit eam Deus stramentum intelligentie, in quod intelligentia efficiat operationes suas, quod est dicere: anima rationalis /A 282/ nobilis, primo loco post angelum creata a Deo, et ab ipso, mediante angelo, suas recipit bonitates et operationes.

¹ It should be noticed that *relaxatur* is not completely satisfying in this context. However, considering that the manuscript reads it clearly, we have chosen to keep it in the text and translate it accordingly.

The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife

[1. The inner, outer, and composite human]

‘Although they were in a state of honour, humans lacked understanding when they put themselves on the same level as the foolish beasts of burden, and they became like them.’

According to what ancient and modern experts of divine things and the texts of legislators and philosophers seem to maintain, ‘human’ is said in three ways. For it is said of the inner human, the outer human, and their composite. Also called divine, the inner human is not said to be inner as if she were enclosed by something containing her or embraced by a surface, but because the inner human is completely hidden from the senses. And I think that is said about the inner human, that ‘according to my inner human, then, I delight in God’s law,’ since God’s law and the observance of His commands provide the soul with utmost delight.

The outer human is also called sensible (*sensibilis*) and natural (*naturalis*), not because she is something cut off outside something else or containing something else within herself, but because the outer human is shown by the senses, being grasped and laid out by them. And we mean the outer human, which is the body alone, when we say that ‘this human is healthy or sick, white or black.’

In turn, the composite human, which is also called dialectic (*dialecticus*) and categorial (*predicamentalis*), is stated to be made of both the inner and the outer human. And I think that it is said about her ‘just as the rational soul and the flesh make one human’ and also that ‘although they were in a state of honour, the human did not understand’ etc.

And it is true that the human was created in a state of honour because, as regards to the body, she has a better composition and a more tempered mixture (*complexio*) than any composition and mixture, and in regard to the soul, too, she is governed and vivified by a soul nobler than any others. And it is said about her ‘because [the human being] is created in image and similarity to God.’ And Aristotle said about her in the *Book of Pure Goodness* that [this is the case] ‘because the noble soul,’ that is, the rational soul, is created by God ‘through the Intelligence,’ and God placed her ‘as the subject (*stramentum*) of the intelligence, in which the intelligence carries out its operations.’ And this corresponds to saying that the noble rational soul is created by God immediately after the angels and from Him, through the mediation of the angels, receives her goodness and operations.

De homine autem exteriori, scilicet corpore, non est nobis cura in his sermonibus multa inquirere, quoniam (quantum A) naturale est et ad phisicos pertinet. Similiter et hominem compositum pretermittimus, quem legum instituta coercent. Ad solum hominem interiorem, qui et occultus et divinus dicitur, nostram orationem dirigimus, stilumque nostre locutionis convertimus. Dicamus igitur dispositiones ad quas homines perveniunt interiores, quod est dicere quem statum anime nostre, postquam a corporibus exuuntur, consequantur, et secundum quod apud philosophye peritissimos et prophetas et legis et ecclesie doctores invenitur, quamvis non ex toto demonstrationibus nunc approbetur.

[2. The threefold dispositions of soul and body]

Primo igitur sciendum est quod et que de naturis et que de animabus et que de angelicis substantiis et de essentia divina scire et confiteri tenemur, per exempla huius mundi et similes dispositiones rerum corporearum rebus spiritualibus designare valemus. Unde quidam ex sapien- /A 283/ tissimis ait: Mundus hic minor exemplum est maioris mundi ordine. Et Paulus etiam hoc idem tangere videtur, ut extimo, dicens: Invisibilia enim Dei a creatura mundi per ea que facta sunt intellecta conspiciuntur et (A om.) artificius secundus mundus a primo cognoscitur. Et alibi idem Apostolus: Fide enim intelligimus aptata esse secula verbo Dei, ut ex invisibilibus visibilia fierent. Quicumque ergo vult salvus esse, ante omnia opus est ei corporis dispositiones aspicere, et per eas animarum a corporibus denudatarum dispositiones poterit apprehendere.

Videat itaque quod corporis dispositiones sunt tres, scilicet sanitas, egritudo, et que naeutralitas appellatur. Sanitas est quando corpus se habet bene et ducitur cum moderatione et secundum naturam suam degit incolume. Egritudo est quando a moderatione labitur et temperantia, et degit cum languore et dolore et dispertemperantia. Neutralitas est quando nec vere sanitas nec egritudo est, sed inter duas dispositiones scilicet sanissimi et egerimi corporis media.

The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife

In the present discussion, it is not important to inquire in detail into the outer human, that is, the body, since the body is something natural that pertains to [the study of] natural philosophers. In a similar fashion, we leave out [from the discussion] the composite human, who is restrained by the teaching of the Laws. My discourse is directed, and the style of my language adapted to, the inner human alone, who is said to be hidden and divine. Let me discuss, then, about the dispositions that are attained by inner humans (which corresponds to discussing the state that our souls acquire when they leave the bodies) also according to what can be found in the [books of] the best experts in philosophy, the prophets, and the teachers of the Law and the Church, although it will not be proved in full by demonstrations.

[2. The threefold dispositions of soul and body]

First, we must know that we are bound to know and confess about nature, souls, angelic substances, and the divine essence. We are able to point out to spiritual things through examples from [this] world and similar dispositions among bodily things. Accordingly, one of the wisest people said that ‘This lower world is an example of the higher world according to its order.’ And Paul, too, seems to touch upon the same point, I think, when he says that ‘For the invisible aspects of God are intellectually grasped by the creatures of the world through the things that [He] made’ and the second, crafted, world is known by the first. And elsewhere, the same apostle says: ‘For we understand by faith that our world (secula) has been adapted to the word of God,’ so that what is visible could come into being from what is invisible. Hence, anyone who wants to be saved, first of all needs to examine her bodily dispositions and, through them, she will be able to grasp the dispositions of the souls when they are stripped from the bodies.

Consequently, one can see that the bodily dispositions are three, which are called health, sickness, and neutrality. Health [occurs] when the body is in good condition, governed with moderation, and lives unscathed according to its nature. Sickness [occurs] when the body falls from moderation and temperance and lives with weakness, pain, and intemperance. Neutrality [occurs] when it is not truly healthy or sick, but is in the middle between two dispositions, namely, that of the healthiest and the sickest body.

Similiter et anime dispositiones sunt tres, scilicet dextra et sinistra /A 284/ et media. Dextra etiam anime dispositio in scientie divine libris multis nominibus appellatur. Nam dicitur pars dextra ovium et similiter pars sinistra edorum. Unde dicitur: Statuet quidem oves a dextris, edos autem a sinistris, et dicitur dispositio dextra felicitas et sinistra miseria. Preterea dextra pars dicitur beatitudo et paradus, et sinistra cruciatus /85vb/ et infernus et multis etiam nominibus utraque poterit appellari, de quibus non est modo dicendum per singula.

Adhuc etiam dicendum quod sicut dum anima est cum corpore, corpus potest quamlibet suarum dispositionum successive recipere et de una ad aliam permutari, ut de sanitate ad egritudinem et neutralitatem et econverso (e contrario A). Similiter et anima potest omnes suas dispositiones recipere successive, quia de bona potest mala fieri, et media, et econverso (e contrario A); et sicut corpus, postquam exiit ab eo anima, naturaliter tendit ad corruptionem et dissolutionem in partes, eo quod omne generatum naturaliter est aptum corrumpi, nisi aliquid aliud ei adiungatur quod conservet ipsum et retineat virtute sua, similiter et anima, /A 285/ postquam exuta est, naturaliter tendit ad integritatem et unionem sui ipsius, eo quod omne creatum naturaliter est aptum uniri et integrari nisi pravum accidens vincat in ea, quod ipsam retrahat a sua integritate et unitione.

[3. The ten degrees of happiness]

Redeundum est ad dispositiones ad quas anime humane pervenire videntur, et primo de dispositione dextra, que et paradus dicitur et felicitas, secundum illud autem quod in scienciis divinis reperitur. Felicitates vite denudate et ab hac corporeitate immunis decem modis esse reperiuntur in suis ordinibus, secundum maioritatem et minoritatem, a prima infima usque ad ultimam supremam et econverso (e contrario A).

The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife

In a similar way, the dispositions of the soul, too, are three: right, left, and middle. In the books of divine science, the righthand disposition of the soul is called by many names, too. For the right side is said of the sheep and the left side of the goats. Hence, it is said that 'he should place the sheep on the right and the goats on the left.' And the righthand disposition is called happiness while the left disposition, misery. Moreover, the right side is called bliss and paradise while the left side [is called] torture and hell, and one can call them by many other names, too, which there is no need to mention one by one now.

Furthermore, it must be said that, as long as the soul is joined to the body, the latter is able to receive all its dispositions one after the other and change from one to another, such as from health to sickness and neutrality, and the other way around. In a similar way, the soul, too, can receive all her dispositions one after the other, since from being good she can become bad and [get in] a middle position, and the other way round. And like the body, which tends naturally to be corrupted and dissolved into parts when the soul leaves it (since everything generated is naturally apt to be corrupted if there is nothing added to it to preserve it and hold it by its power), so the soul, when she has left the body, tends naturally to her integrity and her own union. This happens because every creature is naturally apt to be made one and completed when no improper accident prevails in it, degrading it from its completeness and unity.

[3. The ten degrees of happiness]

Let us go back to the dispositions which the human soul appears to reach and, first, to the righthand disposition, which is called paradise and happiness according to what is found in the divine sciences. Ten kinds of happiness of life that is stripped away and immune from this corporeity are found in their orders, from greatness to smallness, starting from the lowest to the utmost highest and the other way round.

Prima igitur et minor omnibus felicitas ad quam anima rationalis devenire poterit est ut sit anima potens super hunc mundum corporeum corruptibilem agere aliquid quod voluerit. Imperat enim anima nature quia excelsior ea facta est et bonitate acquisita et ordine creationis /A 286/ proprio et sic et proprias exercet operationes in hec corpora et motus nature cui imperat eis advenire facit. Est ergo anima in prima et minori felicitate potens ad minus generare, corrumpere, augmentare, diminuere, alterare et secundum loca mutare et hec facit natura mediante cui dominatur, corporibus etiam vitam tribuit et nutrimentum, hec a Deo nostro, cuius fama est sublimis, tanquam a causa superiori recipiens. Et quis dubitat animam tantam et talem esse, quando divinam contemplatur essentiam et angelos eius absque velamine, et recipit quod vult ab eis absque impedimento, cum hoc etiam concedatur ei facere quando veste corporis velatur et tegitur, et non penitus faciem excelsae maiestatis intuetur. Nonne dictum est quia homines (bonos MS/A) hec signa sequentur, demonia eiicient, linguis loquentur novis, serpentes tollent, leprosos mundabunt, mortuos suscitabunt et multa talia non est dubitandum.

Secunda felicitas et prima sublimior et eam ordine precedens est ut sciat anima scientia certa quicquid est infra et certificetur in veritate /A 287/ tibus rerum sub ea positarum, scilicet anime irrationalis et anime vegetabilis et nature et corporum celestium et corporum (MS adds 'et') elementorum et elementatorum omnium. Et cum hec videant et sciant homines in vita ista in qua anima multa obtenebratur ignorantia, non est dubitandum quin in vita beatitudinis perspicacius hec intueantur et videant. De hoc autem extimo fore dictum: Videmus nunc per speculum in enigmate, tunc autem facie ad faciem, et qui sunt in hac felicitate et faciunt ea que in prima felicitate fiunt, et imperant ut faciant illis qui (que A) habent ea facere, et ideo dicuntur archiministri (archisministri MS) et principes.

Tertia felicitas has duas antecedens et eis maior natura est ut sit anima virtuosa delectuosa in his que operatur, et ut complaceat sibi ipsi et suis operibus et ipsa sibi, et ut sit informata impressionibus virtutum quas habuit cum corpore convenientium sue nature et proprietati, et propter eas gaudebit gaudio magno, de quo intendo dictum fuisse: Gaudent in celis (celum A) anime sanctorum, et multa talia. /A 288/ Virtutes autem nature anime convenientes sunt, ut misericordia, patientia, humilitas, dilectio et multa talia.

The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife

The happiness that is first and the smallest of all that the rational soul can reach is for the soul to become able to operate anything she wants over this bodily corruptible world. For the soul commands nature because she was made more sublime than it, both through the goodness she has acquired and through her own order in creation. Consequently, she carries out her own operations upon these bodies and makes the movements of nature that she commands come to them [the bodies]. Therefore, the soul in her first and smaller happiness is able at least to generate, corrupt, increase, diminish, and change qualities and places, and she does so through the nature she commands. And the soul bestows upon bodies life and nourishment, which, like from a higher cause, she receives from our God, whose reputation is sublime. And who can doubt that the soul is so great and of such a kind, when the soul is able to contemplate, unveiled, the divine essence and His angels, receiving what she wants from them without hindrance, when she is allowed to do so even while she is veiled and covered by the attire of the body and cannot wholly admire the face of the highest Majesty. Is it not said that humans ‘will follow these signs, expel demons, speak new languages, get rid of snakes,’ cleanse the lepers, resuscitate the dead, and many such things that we must not doubt?

More sublime than the first happiness and preceding it in order, the second happiness is for the soul to have firm knowledge of whatever is below and ascertain according to truth what is below—that is, the irrational and vegetative souls, nature, the celestial bodies, the bodies, the elements, and all things made of elements. And since humans see and know these things during this earthly life in which the soul is clouded by much ignorance, one should not doubt that all these things are admired and seen more insightfully during the life of bliss. And I think that it will be said about this that ‘Now we see in riddles through a mirror, then [we will see] face to face.’ And those in this [second] happiness can also do what those in the first happiness do, and command that they should do to those what they have to do, and for this reason they are called high priests and princes.

Preceded by these two and of a greater nature than them, the third happiness is for the soul to be virtuous and delighted in what she does, both so that she is pleased with herself and her works and they [her works] are pleased with her, and so that she is shaped by the impressions of the virtues that she has had in the body, which conform to her nature and property, and to rejoice because of them with great joy. And about this I understand it was said that ‘The souls of the saints rejoice in the heavens’ and many other things like this. Indeed, virtues such as mercy, patience, humility, delight and many more of this sort are suited to the nature of the soul.

Quarta ut sit anima luminosa in sua essentia clara, videns se ipsam ex profundo, cognoscens et in se et in aliis omnes impressiones et simulacra omnium eorum que cogitantur et dicuntur et fiunt, et de hoc credo Paulum dicere: Quia oportet nos manifestari ante tribunal Christi in propriis conscientiis, ut referat unusquisque prout gessit in corpore sive bonum sive malum, et quia anima iusta in aliis suas miserias cognoscet et quare etiam in miseriis sint et tormentis dictum credo fuisse: Videbunt iusti et timebunt et super eum ridebunt et dicent, etc. Et alibi: Stabunt iusti in magna constantia adversus eos, etc. De luminositate etiam animarum iustarum credo dictum fuisse, nescio tamen an propter ipsarum lumen dictum sit: Fulgebunt iusti sicut sol etc., et Ecclesia dicit: Lux eterna luceat eis etc. et lux perpetua luceat etc.

Quinta est ut sit anima se /86ra/dens firmiter locata, quod est dicere quiescens ab omni labore non egens acquisitione alicuius rei quia sibi ipsi exposita est et manifesta, et scit quia habet omne quo indiget et ad quod fuit possibile pervenire secundum aptitudinem suarum operationum et quantitatem meritorum et sic sufficit sibi ipsi, et de hac sufficientia et quiete credo Ecclesiam rogare cum dicit: Requiem eternam dona eis, Domine, et de tali etiam sessione et firma locatione credo dictum esse quod: Sedent iusti a dextris virtutis Dei, et: Multi venient ab Oriente et Occidente et recumbent cum Abraham, et Ysaac et Iacob in regno celorum.

Sexta est ut dominetur anima sibi ipsi et obediat sibi ipsi et ut dominans et dominatum sint idem, quod est dicere ut ipsa sit equata sibi ipsi in velle et habere et posse et est sensus: tantum velit habere quantum habet vel habere potest et econverso (e contrario A) et tantum velit facere quantum facit vel facere potest et econverso (e contrario A), et sic non erit diminutio in sua essentia, actu nec potentia, quia sua essentia eadem est suis formis et sue forme eedem cum ea et hanc equationem dominationemque fe- /A 289/ licem nemo habet in vita ista. Imo omnes sumus diminuti, plura volentes quam possumus, et quia hoc sic est, extimo fore dictum: Qui minor est in regno celorum, maior est Iohanne Baptista, et illud: Cum venerit quod perfectum est, evacuabitur quod ex parte est.

The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife

The fourth happiness is for the soul to be full of light and bright in her essence, seeing herself from deep inside and knowing both in herself and in others all the impressions and images of all things thought, said, and done. And I believe that Paul refers to this when he says that ‘because we will have to appear before the court of Christ in our own conscience,’ so that everyone will receive [what is due] according to how she behaved while joined to the body, either well or badly. And because the righteous soul knows in others her own miseries and knows, too, the reason why they are in [such] misery and torment, I believe it was said that ‘the righteous shall see, and fear, and laugh over them, and say, etc.’ And elsewhere: ‘The righteous will stand with great firmness against them, etc.’ And concerning the brightness of the righteous souls (although I do not know whether they refer to the souls’ own light), I believe it was said that ‘The righteous shall shine like the sun, etc.’ and the Church says ‘May the eternal Light upon them, etc.’ and ‘May the perpetual Light, etc.’

The fifth happiness is for the soul to be steadily placed at rest, which corresponds to saying that she is relieved of all labour and without needing to acquire anything because the soul is exposed and manifest to herself. And the soul knows that she has all that she needs and that could reach according to the capacities of her operations and the number of her merits – and this is enough for the soul herself. And I believe that the Church prays for such sufficiency and rest when it is said: ‘Give them eternal peace, Lord.’ And about such permanence and steady place I believe it is said that ‘The righteous sit on the right hand of God’s virtue;’ and that ‘Many shall come from East and West and take their seat with Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob in the heavenly kingdom.’

The sixth happiness is for the soul to rule herself and be obedient to herself and that the ruler and ruled should be the same, which amounts to saying that the soul is made identical to herself as regards to what she wants, has, and can do. The meaning is: the soul wants to have as much as she has and can have, and the other way round. And the soul wants to do as much as what she does and can do, and the other way around. And consequently, there will not be any diminution in her essence, neither in act nor in potency, because her essence is identical to her forms and her forms are identical with herself, and nobody has such balance and such happy rule during this [earthly] life. In fact, we are all diminished, wanting more than we can [have], and for this reason I think it has been said that ‘The least in the kingdom of heaven is better than John the Baptist’ and that ‘when what is perfect comes, what is only in part will leave.’

Septima est ut sensu intellectibili sentiat anima fluxum luminis a divina essentia et mentis beneplacitum et quod complacet Deo in ipsa anima et anime in ipso Deo et sicut mens sive intentio regis diligentis militem suum dicitur quiescere et sedere in ipso milite, similiter et Dei mens et intentio et luminis irradiatio descendit in animam iustam et sedet et quiescit in ipsa et quia in tali sic sedet anima Deus et ipsa in Deo, exaltata est super alias animas multas et fert sententiam super illas, dicendo quia debent dampnari vel beari, et ideo dictum est: Quia sedebitis et vos super sedes duodecim iudicantes duodecim tribus Israel. Et in hac sede erat Abraham dicens diviti: Fili, recordare, etc., et sic duo sunt sedere anime hic dicta:² in minori fuit Lazarus, in maiori Abraham.

Octava est ut sit anima picta et formata et figurata omnibus picturis et formis et figuris omnium substantiarum et accidentium et superiorum se et inferiorum et sciat et contempletur ordinem totius veritatis et esse in seipsa impressum et simulacratum et in contemplando hec inflammetur et sit cupida et delectans absque interpollatione et discessione quoniam contemplatur ipsum apud quem non est transmutatio nec vicissitudinis obumbratio et in quem ordines angelorum desiderant prospicere.

Nona est ut sit diligens has formas et figuras et omnia simulacra impressa in se, et diligat omnes substantias superiores se et inferiores et accidentia, quod est dicere: diligat ordinem bonitatis in esse et placeat ei quicquid est in ordine suo et numeret se in universitate rerum, et equet se rebus et res sibi et sic gaudium consequatur equatum cui nichil deest et sic sine temporis sectione psallat et laudet Deum qui adhuc remansit super se et benedicat ei secundum ordines rerum et de hoc potuit esse dictum: Benedictus es, Domine Deus (A om.) patrum nostrorum et: Benedicite omnia opera Domini Domino et multa talia, quoniam ipse attingit a fine usque ad finem fortiter et disponit omnia suaviter.

² The reading is clear, but the text appears to be corrupt.

The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife

The seventh happiness is for the soul to perceive by intellective perception the flux of light proceeding from the divine essence, and what is pleasing to the mind, and what pleases God is in the soul and what pleases the soul is in God Himself. And just as the mind or intention of an intelligent king who, loving his army, is said to rest and dwell in the army itself, so the mind of God, too, and His intention and the radiation of light descend into the righteous soul and dwells and rests in her. And because God dwells in such a soul in this way and that soul dwells in God, the soul is exalted above many other souls and passes sentence on them by saying that they are to be either damned or beatified. And therefore it is said that ‘you also will sit on twelve thrones judging the twelve tribes of Israel.’ And in that seat was Abraham when he said to the wealthy man ‘Son, remember’ etc. Consequently, two souls are said to sit there: ‘in a lower [seat] Lazarus, in a higher one, Abraham.’

The eighth happiness is for the soul to be adorned, formed, and shaped by all adornments, forms, and shapes of all substances and accidents both above and below herself. And she should know and contemplate the order of all truth and being which is impressed and exemplified as images in the soul herself. And by contemplating all this, the soul should be inflamed and be longing and delighting without interruption or departure because she contemplates That in Whom there is no change nor shadow of vicissitude and upon Whom the orders of angels want to gaze.

The ninth happiness is for the soul to cherish those forms, shapes, and all the images that are impressed in herself, and to appreciate all the substances and accidents that are above and below the soul herself. And this amounts to saying that she should appreciate the order of goodness in being and that the soul should be pleased with anything that is in her own order, and should number herself within the universality of [existing] things, and should be made identical to [all] things and makes [all] things identical to herself. And by doing this, the soul should reach a complete joy that lacks nothing. And without any division of time, the soul should sing psalms and praise God, Who still remains above the soul, and bless according to the order of things. And we can say about this that ‘You are blessed, God, the Lord of our fathers,’ and ‘Bless the Lord, all the works of the Lord,’ and many other things like this, because He ‘reaches from one end to the other with strength and arranges everything with sweetness.’

Decima est ut sit anima non comprehendens sed apprehendens in esse suo esse infinitum sicut apprehendit homo voluntatem infinitam et insatiabilem esse in se cum ipse in se sit totus finitus et apprehendat /A 291/ intellectu necessitatem infiniti esse, et primarietatem, et quod ipsum est causa causarum et causa prima et vita prima sive Pater, et scientia prima sive Filius et voluntas prima sive Spiritus et quod hec tria sic dicta in ipso esse sunt unum et ipsa sunt illud esse et illud esse est illa, et cum sic apprehendit illud esse, uniat se illi et applicet, ex cuius applicatione et unitione iam repleatur lumine, satiatur adventu omnium optatorum et sit sancta et firmata cum illo quod est firmorum firmissimum et virtus virtutum, et de hoc forte dixit propheta: Satiabor cum apparuerit gloria tua, et versus etiam est de hoc: Nil ibi deficiet, Deus omnibus omnia fiet.

[4. The ascent of the soul]

Adhuc etiam distinctio simplicis esse in decem partes facienda est, prout est super animam rationalem, eo quod omnis beatitudo et felicitas anime rationalis est tantum a superioribus essentiis et, in existentia sua cum illis; di- /86rb/ stinguitur ergo esse simplex quod est super animam in decem ordines et secundum continentiam ad similitudinem celorum.

Prima et infima omnium pars bona est, et felix et simplex, et est intelligentia agens et substantia operans et ministrans et angelus ad cuius societatem cum pervenerit anima iam ei assimilata est et equata et ideo ut puto dicitur: Quia erimus sicut angeli Dei in celo.

Secunda pars continet primam et est ea felicior et simplicior et in operatione potentior et luminosior et in scientia virtuosior et certior, ad cuius consortium cum pervenit anima iam est cum archangelis et in secunda felicitate.

Tertia est his duabus altior et in simplicitate et opere et scientia et omnibus donis potior et precipue in iocunditate delectatione ex primi /A 292/ meriti convenientia, et anima ad hoc pertingens iam est particeps ordinis virtutum.

The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife

The tenth happiness is for the soul not to comprehend but apprehend the infinite Being in her own being, just as a human apprehends that an infinite and unsatiable will is in herself although she is wholly finite in herself. And the soul should apprehend with her intellect the necessity and primacy of the infinite Being, and that He is the cause of causes, the first cause, and the first life (that is, the Father), the first knowledge (that is, the Son), and the first will (that is, the Holy Ghost). And [the soul should apprehend] that these three, so called, are One according to their own being and they are that Being and that Being is them. And when the soul apprehends that Being, she should become one with It and attached to It. From such attachment and union, the soul should be instantly filled with light, satisfied with the arrival of all wishes and sanctified and made steady with that which is the steadiest of all steady [things] and the virtue of all virtues. And perhaps the prophet was referring to this when he said that 'I shall be satiated when Your glory appears,' and also about this is the verse 'Nothing will be lacking there, God will be everything in everything.'

[4. The ascent of the soul]

We still must distinguish among ten regions (partes) of the simple Being, since it is above the rational soul because all beatitude and happiness of the rational soul only comes from the higher essences and the soul's existence with them. Hence, the simple Being which is above the soul is distinguished into ten orders and according to containment similar to the heavens.

The first and lowest of all these regions is good, happy, and simple: it is the Active Intelligence, which is a working and governing substance and an angel. When she becomes associated with it, the soul is instantly assimilated and made identical to the Active Intelligence, and I suppose that [for this reason] it is said that 'then we shall be like angels of God in heaven.'

The second region contains the first and is happier and simpler than that, mightier brighter in its working, and its knowledge is more virtuous and better. When the soul reaches such fellowship, she gets instantly together with the Archangels and enjoys the second degree of happiness.

The third region is higher than these two in simplicity, works, and knowledge, and because it has more of all gifts, and particularly it has more joyfulness and delight from its adherence to the first merit, the soul that gets there instantly participates in the order of the Virtues.

Quarta est (A om.; MS unclear) adhuc maior his in omnibus in lumine splendidior et omnibus aliis donis intensior et in cognitione proprii meriti manifestior, et hec est felicitas animarum in ordine potestatum.

Quinta (Quintum MS/A) est his omnibus fortior in formis et felicitatibus omnibus predictis, et precipue in firmitudine et quiete ab omni indigentia et labore; ad quem ordinem cum pervenerit anima iam est in ordine principatum, scilicet participans felicitate ipsorum quamvis non equata illis.

Sexta est his omnibus altior et infinitior, simplicior, in omnibus predictis donis ditior et precipue in equatione sui ad se ipsam et sufficientia sui ipsius in se, et hic est ordo dominationum ad quem pervenit anima rationalis futura felix.

Septima est comprehendens has omnes et essentia et proprietatibus predictis et precipue ut acquiescat Deus precibus suis et optatis omnibus, et sufficiat Deo super his que sunt in anima, et hec anima iam pervenit ad statum tronorum persimilie.

Octava est omnibus his altior, et in eis omnibus existens, et diffusa essentialiter sicut etiam est natura omnium substantiarum simplicium diffundi in omnia sua inferiora et hec est penultima substantiarum et est universalior et completior in figuris et formis et in contemplatione totius veritatis et esse et vicinior infinitati pure omnibus predictis, et plus ardet et concupiscit in delectatione essentie universalis et eius scientie absque cessatione et meditatione et est ordo seraphim ad quem potest etiam anima pervenire persimile.

Nona est omnibus excelsior et elevatior et est solium ultimum, finis substantie et formarum et totius finitatis et creatum primum, diligens ordinem bonitatis in esse universo, dilectione infinita, et diligens causam /A 293/ suam dilectione unita, cui non potest advenire seiunctio, et est luminosa et sciens et in omni quod fuit ei possibile perfecta usque ad finem possibilitatis, et est felicissima omnium et est cherubin ad cuius felicitatis similitudinem cum pervenerit anima iam dicitur cum cherubin esse et (A om.) beatissima.

The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife

The fourth region is even greater than all the others, for its light is brighter, its gifts are mightier than all the others, and it has a clearer understanding of its own merits. And this is the happiness of the souls in the order of the Powers.

The fifth region is stronger than all the others with respect to all the forms and happinesses that have been mentioned above, and particularly with respect to its firmness and rest from all need and labour. When the soul reaches this order, she joins instantly the order of the Principalities and participates of their happiness although she is not made identical to them.

The sixth region is higher, more infinite, and simpler than all the others, richer in all the gifts I have mentioned above and particularly in its equality with itself and sufficiency in itself. And this is the order of the Dominations, which is reached by the rational soul which is going to be happy.

The seventh region includes all these both in essence and in the properties mentioned above, and particularly so that God may give assent to all her prayers and desires and that God might be content over those things that are in the soul. And that soul instantly reaches a position very similar to that of the Thrones.

The eighth region is higher than all the others and exists in all of them. It is diffused in an essential manner because it is the nature of all simple substances to diffuse [themselves] into everything which is below. This [eighth region] is the penultimate [region] of substances, more universal and complete in shapes and forms and according to the contemplation of the whole truth and being. And it is closer to the pure infinity than all that I have mentioned above. And [this region] burns and desires more in the delight of the universal essence. And its knowledge is without any interruption or meditation. That is the order of the Seraphs, and the soul can reach a state very similar to theirs.

The ninth region is more sublime and higher than all the others and is the ultimate Seat, the limit of [all] substances and forms and of all finiteness. It is the first created being that is delighted by the order of goodness in the universal Being through an infinite delight, and it loves its Cause through a uniting love that cannot be severed. And it is bright, and knowledgeable, and perfect in every way that has been possible for it, up to the utmost limit of possibility. It is the happiest of every existing thing; it is [the region of] the Cherubim, and when the soul reaches a happiness similar to the Cherubim's, she is said to be most blessed and to be with the Cherubim.

Decima pars non est substantia, sed essentia prima, et est Deus noster cuius nomen excelsum est et fama sublimis et ipse sedet super illud iam dictum solium excelsum et elevatum, et replet sua essentia et lumine illud et quicquid est infra ipsum usque ad centrum terre quod est abissus, et videt totum et scit totum scientia essentiali ita quod nichil est vacuum vel absconsum ab eius virtute et essentia, et ipse est causa prima et virtus virtutum et factor primus et lumen primum et purum in fine puritatis, finis rerum sine fine sui, principium earum sine principio, ens bonus et verus in fine bonitatis et veritatis, simplex in fine simplicitatis, lumen inluminans non inluminatum, necessarium in fine necessitatis et quicquid est post ipsum habet aliquid de possibilitate et contingentia, sed ipse non, et est producens quicquid est ex se, nullo mediante, vel alio, et est vita prima, vel Paternitas, scientia prima vel Filiatio, voluntas prima, vel Spiritualitas sancta, et hec in ipso non recipiunt vel non habent alietatem vel diversitatem, sed sunt penitus unum, immo quantum ad inferiora sunt tres persone.

/A 294/ Ad similitudinem autem huius felicitatis dicunt phyloso- /86va/phi Iudeorum quidam animam Moyseos pervenisse; ego autem usque ad hoc tempus non reperi in scriptis animam alicuius pervenisse ad unitatem huius felicitatis preter Christi, de quo Ecclesia canit: quod ascendens super omnes celos sedet ad dexteram maiestatis in excelsis. Nam sub hoc sensu credo posse dictum esse quod ipse et pater sint (sit MS) unum, et quod clarificatus est claritate que erat apud patrem priusquam mundus fieret, et quod eius felicitas transcendit statum totius angelice essentie, et dictum est: quia tanto melior est angelis effectus quanto differentius pre illis nomen hereditavit, et hec pauca de his sufficiant.

[5. The ten miseries of the soul]

Dispositio autem sinistra que et infernus et tormentum dicitur similiter est decem modis.

The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife

The tenth region is not substance, but the first essence; it is our God, whose name is sublime and whose fame is the highest. And He sits on that sublime and high seat that I have mentioned above, and He fills with His own essence and light both it [i.e., the seat] and everything lying below it down to the centre of the earth, which is the abyss. He sees the whole and knows the whole through an essential knowledge, so that nothing is empty or hidden from His power and essence. He is the first cause and the power of powers, the first maker, and the first light which is pure to the utmost limit of purity. He is the endless end of [all] things, their principleless principle, being good and true to the utmost limit of goodness and truth, simple to the utmost limit of simplicity, illuminating light which is not illuminated, necessary to the utmost limit of necessity, and whatever follows Him has something of possibility and contingency, but He does not. He produces from Himself every existing thing, without mediation or in other ways. And He is the first Life (or Fatherhood), the first Knowledge (or Sonhood), the first Will (or Holy Ghostness). He does not receive these characteristics in Himself, but they are completely One, with no otherness or diversity – although they are three Persons in respect to what is below.

Some Jewish philosophers maintain that the soul of Moses reached a degree of happiness similar to this. I, however, up to this time have not found in the texts that the soul of anyone has reached the unity of such happiness apart from that of Christ, about whom the Church sings that ‘ascending over all the heavens, He sits on high at the right hand of the Majesty.’ In this sense, indeed, I believe we can take what is said about ‘He and the Father are one’ and that ‘He is brightened by the brightness that was with the Father before He made the world,’ and that His happiness exceeds the condition of all angelic essences. And it is said that ‘since He is made as better than the angels as the name He has inherited is superior.’ These few references about Him will suffice.

[5. The ten miseries of the soul]

The left disposition [of the soul], which is called hell and torment, is similarly given in ten ways.

Prima est ut non possit operari anima quod vult, quia non habet obediens sibi nec cui imperet, nec proprias operationes secundum creationem exercere potest, et cum hoc cupiat et non possit, torquetur. Declinat enim tunc anima ab intelligentia agente, scilicet ab angelo per unum gradum, et remanet involuta circa primum celum et naturam. Et quia sic impeditur anima ab operibus suis et ab his que multum cupit, dicitur ligata et in manibus et in pedibus, sicut dicitur homo ligatus qui detinetur ab his que vult facere.

Secunda est ut non sit anima certa in veritatibus, quia contempsit secundum mandatum quod prohibet vanitatem et confirmat veritatem, /A 295/ dicens. Non assumes nomen Dei tui in vanum sed inveniatur falsitates in se et falsas formas non significantes sicut est res, sed inducentes impressiones vanas in essentia anime, non convenientes veritati sue essentie, sicut sunt qui malam fidem et credulitatem habent et tales sunt in secunda declinatione oppositi Archangelis, revoluti circa celum stellatum, et isti non veritate liberantur, quia non eam dilexerunt sed falsitate damnantur, quia ei adhererunt et ignorantes ignorantur, unde illud Apostoli: ignorans ignorabitur a Deo videlicet qui est pura veritas incogniti. Unde ipse dicit eis: Amen dico vobis nescio vos.

Tertia miseria in maiori est declinatione, scilicet ut sit intentio anime circa tertium corpus, scilicet speram Saturni opposita Virtutibus, et sit anima plena odio, ira, invidia, displicens sibi ipsi et suis operibus quia contempsit tertium mandatum quod prohibet servile opus amoremque mundi, dicens: Memento ut diem sabbati sanctifices. Ideoque sibi erit maledicens et suis operibus sueque nativitati, et est similis flenti et stridenti et doloroso.

Quarta est ut sit anima obscura et tenebrosa in sua essentia circa celum Iovis. Verumtamen in tali tenebrositate videatur formas eorum que cogitavit et dixit et fecit, et in hoc est maior pena quam si non recordaretur, et scit quia habetur respectui ab aliis et tales sunt eieci in tenebras exteriores opposita Potestatibus.

The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife

The first misery is for the soul to not be able to do what she wants because she does not have something obeying herself or to receive her commands, and she cannot exert her own operations that she received by creation. And since she craves this and cannot have it, she is in torment. She then moves away by one degree from the Active Intelligence (that is, the angel) and stays wrapped between the first heaven and nature. Because the soul is impeded in this way from her activities and from what she so much craves, she is said to be tied up in both hands and feet, as is said of a tied-up person who is kept from what she wants to do.

The second misery is for the soul not to be certain of truths because she has disdained the second commandment that prohibits vanity and confirms truth by saying 'Do not take the name of your God in vain'. On the contrary, the soul finds falsities within herself and false forms that do not signify things as they are, while inducing vain impressions in the essence of the soul, which do not conform to the truth of her essence. This is the misery of those who have bad faith and credulity. Such [souls] are placed in the second detachment opposite the Archangels, revolving round the starred heaven [i.e., the sphere of fixed stars]. And because they did not find love in the truth, they are not freed by it, and are condemned by falsity, because they adhered to it. Being ignorant, they are not known and, as the Apostle said, 'the one who is ignorant will not be known', i.e., unknown by God Who is the pure truth. And for this reason He will say to them: 'So be it, I can say to you: 'I do not know you'.'

The third misery is greater in detachment and is for the soul to be inclined to the third [celestial] body, i.e., the sphere of Saturn opposite the Virtues. The soul is full of hate, wrath, envy, displeasing to herself and her activities, because she has disdained the third commandment prohibiting slavish activities and mundane love by saying 'Remember to sanctify the Sabbath'. Consequently, the soul will curse herself, and her activities, and her coming to existence, and it is like somebody who is weeping, grinding her teeth, and lamenting.

The fourth misery is for the soul to be obscured and darkened in her own essence in the heaven of Jupiter. In such darkness, nonetheless, the soul sees the forms of what she has thought, said, and done, and, in this condition, there is more pain than if she did not remember. And the soul knows that she is despised by others and such souls are thrown into the exterior darkness opposite the Powers.

Quinta est ut sit anima se /86ra/dens firmiter locata, quod est dicere quiescens ab omni labore non egens acquisitione alicuius rei quia sibi ipsi exposita est et manifesta, et scit quia habet omne quo indiget et ad quod fuit possibile pervenire secundum aptitudinem suarum operationum et quantitatem meritorum et sic sufficit sibi ipsi, et de hac sufficientia et quiete credo Ecclesiam rogare cum dicit: Requiem eternam dona eis, Domine, et de tali etiam sessione et firma locatione credo dictum esse quod: Sedent iusti a dextris virtutis Dei, et: Multi venient ab Oriente et Occidente et recumbent cum Abraham, et Ysaac et Iacob in regno celorum.

Sexta est ut non possit anima dominari sibi ipsi nec obedire nec equari /A 296/ sibi, sed plus vult ex pravo desiderio quam habere possit, sentiens in se formas stimulantes pravum desiderium, cupiens diversos status celi solis, scilicet regnum et (A om. 'regnum et') imperium, cum nichil horum habere possit, opposita Dominationibus.

Septima est ut sensu intelligibili sentiat lumen Dei a se privari et non ab ipso diligi sed odiri et sciat ipsum Deum sibi irasci et in hoc vellet occultari ab eo si posset et in hoc est maior labor quam si posset fugere et hec est dispositio latronis iudicati ad suspensionem latitantis in angulo, et queritur et invenitur et iudicatur ad mortem, se audiente, et est hec anima impedita voluptatibus celi Veneris opposita Tronis.

Octava est ut sit picta astutiis et subtilitatibus huius seculi et curis extimabilibus, fraudulentis et deceptorii et in contemplando hec sit cupida et ardens, cum non possit, involuta proprietatibus celi Mercurii opposita Seraphym.

Nona est ut odiat figuras suas et omnes substantias sibi iunctas, et videtur quod sue forme corrodant ipsam sicut tinea in pannis et vermes in lignis et ordinem bonitatis in esse odiat, et quicquid est, et videat se exclusam a consortio substantiarum felicium et in hoc sit quasi muta, nequam, involuta celo Lune opposita Keru-/86vb/bin.

The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife

The fifth misery is for the soul to descend all the way to the heaven of Mars and not find anything in which she can rest from her inclination. Opposite the Principalities, the soul cannot have what she wants and needs, and goes from one place to another without finding anything suitable: the soul is a wanderer.

The sixth misery is for the soul not to be able to govern, obey, or be identical to herself. By improper desire, she wants more than she can have, as she perceives within herself forms that goad her into that improper desire. And she craves the different conditions of the heaven of the Sun, namely, rule and power, when in fact she can have none of them, and she is opposite the Dominations.

The seventh misery is for the soul to perceive by intelligible perception her being deprived of the light of God and not finding delight from Him, but only hate. And the soul knows that God Himself is irate against her, and she wants to hide from Him, if she could. And in this there is greater hardship than if she could flee. And this is the disposition of the thief judged for hanging, when he is hiding in a corner. And he is sought and found and condemned to death, he himself hearing [the condemnation]. This soul is impeded by the pleasures of the heaven of Venus, being opposite to the Thrones.

The eighth misery is for the soul to be adorned with the ploys and subtleties of this world and [adorned with] concerns that are reckoned as cheating and deceiving. By contemplating this, the soul burns with desire while she cannot [achieve what she wants], being wrapped in the properties of the heaven of Mercury, opposite to the Seraphim.

The ninth misery is for the soul to hate her shapes and all the substances joined to her. It seems that her forms gnaw at her own being like a moth in clothes or a worm in wood. And she hates the order of goodness in being and every existing thing. And she sees herself as banned from the fellowship of happy substances, and in this the soul is almost silent, worthless, and wrapped in the heaven of the Moon, opposite the Cherubim.

Decima inclinatissima omnium inclusa sub orbe, cuius dispositio quandoque est sicut status corporis igne cremati, quandoque vaporibus et fumis fumigati et suffocati, quandoque in glacies congelati, quandoque mole terre et lapidum obruti et oppressi et carcere tenebroso sepulti et hec anima est in inferno inferiori querens aquam contra cruciatum /A 297/ flamme, ignem contra glaciem, liberam respirationem contra strangulationem (transgulationem A, MS before correction), et tandem querens ruinam montium, ut moriatur, et non poterit mori, nec habere aquam nec ignem cum voluerit, nec aliquid aliud quod ei placeat. Ad hanc animam colliguntur omnes pene. Ei in nullo satisfit, movebitur et inquietabitur sine interpollatione et sine fine, et hec omnia habet absque spe vel fiducia evasionis et hec est remotissima omnium a Deo nostro benedicto, cuius solius est dare felicitates.

[6. Three legislators and the Law]

Has autem decem felicitates et decem miseras generales hic nominatas, cognoverunt ut extimo et vehementer credo, si vera sunt que leguntur, legumlatores iusti, sapientissimi, alios salvare curantes, super quos cecidit lumen Dei et eius cognitio et eius verbum super linguas eorum, sicut Moyses et Mahometh et Christus qui fuit potentior his duobus et sermone virtuosior, et ideo et prohibitiones inierunt, et edicta decreverunt decem et decem, inita prohibuerunt ut animas a tormentis retraherent, decreta ediderunt ut animas beatas redderent.

Primum ex decem prohibitis est hoc quod dicit Deus per Moysen: Non habebis deos alienos coram me; per hoc retrahitur anima a pena decima. Primum ex decretis est quod dicitur per Christum: Diliges Dominum Deum tuum ex toto corde et opere; per hoc elevatur anima ad felicitatem decimam.

Secundum ex prohibitis est: celeste vel terrestre vel aliud quod colas non sculpes vel adores; per hoc retrahitur anima a pena nona. Secundum ex affirmatis vel preceptis est: Dominum Deum tuum adorabis, et: Ora patrem tuum qui est in abscondito; et multa talia; per hoc elevatur ad felicitatem nonam.

The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife

The tenth misery is the most detached of all and is enclosed below the orb [of the Earth]. Its disposition sometimes is like the condition of bodies cremated by fire, sometimes like that of bodies that are fumigated and suffocated by vapours and smoke, sometimes like bodies that are frozen in ice, and sometimes like bodies that are crushed and weighed down by a bulk of earth and stones, buried in a dark prison. And this soul is in the lower hell, looking for water against the torture of flames, fire against the ice, free breath against choking. Finally, she looks for the collapse of mountains, so as to die. But she cannot die. Nor can she have water or fire, as she would like to, nor anything else that she desires. That soul suffers all punishments together. She is not satisfied by anything: she will be moved and disturbed without pause or end. And the soul has all that without hope or confidence in escaping. She is placed farthest away from our blessed God, Who, alone, can bestow happiness.

[6. Three legislators and the Law]

And I think and strongly believe that, if what is read is true, these ten kinds of happiness and misery mentioned here in general have been known by the just and wisest legislators like Moses, Mohammed, and Christ (who was more powerful than those two and his words were more virtuous), who cared about saving others and upon whom God bestowed His light, and His knowledge, and His word on their tongues. And therefore they introduced prohibitions and decreed orders, ten and ten; they introduced prohibitions to save the souls from the torments and they decreed orders to beatify the souls.

The first of the ten prohibitions is what God said through Moses: 'You shall not have other Gods than me.' Through this prohibition, the soul is saved from the tenth punishment. The first decree is what is said through Christ: 'Love your Lord God with all your heart and works.' Through it, the soul ascends to the tenth happiness.

The second prohibition is 'Do not carve nor praise any terrestrial, celestial, or anything to worship.' Through it, the soul is saved from the ninth punishment. The second claim or precept is 'You shall praise your Lord God' and 'Pray your Father, Who is hidden' and many things like these. Through this the soul ascends to the ninth happiness.

/A 298/ Tercium ex vetitis est: Non assumas nomen Dei tui in vanum. Per hoc prohibetur anima a pena octava. Tercium ex preceptis est: Deum time, et mandata eius observa, et: Qui timet Deum facit bona. Per hoc ascendit anima ad felicitatem octavam.

Quartum prohibitivum est: Memento ut diem sabbati sanctifices, sex diebus operaberis et septimo requiesces. Per hoc separatur anima a septima pena. Quartum ex preceptis est: Operamini non cibum qui perit sed qui permanet, etc. Quintum est constitutum prohibitivum: Qui maledixerit patri vel matri, morte moriatur, et hoc revocat animam a sexta pena. Quintum ex mandatis precipientibus est: Honora patrem tuum et matrem; et: Cole parentes, (A adds 'et') per hoc advocatur anima ad beatitudinem sextam.

Sextum contradicens est: Non occides; per hoc disiungitur anima a pena quinta. Sextum preceptum, quod servari debet ut omnes diligamus ad invicem amicos et inimicos ut et animas nostras ad invicem ponamus, sicut pro nobismetipsis, et hoc dat gloriam quintam.

Septimum contradicens est: Non mechaberis; per hoc separatur anima a miseria quarta. Septimum mandatum precipiens quod dicitur tam viris quam mulieribus est: Nolite fraudare ad invicem, et: Reddite debita ad invicem, et hoc trahit animam ad requiem quartam.

Octavum prohibens est: Non furtum facies. Per hoc cadit anima a cruciatu tertio. Octavum precipiens (precians MS/A) est: Date elemosinam et: Magis laboret homo manibus suis operando ut habeat unde tribuat necessitatem patienti, per hoc vocatur anima ad beatitudinem tertiam.

Nonum est: Non falsum testimonium dices, hoc est prohibitivum, vetans animam a pena secunda. Nonum preceptum est: Loquimini (loquemini A) veritatem unusquisque cum proximo suo et hoc confortat animam ad felicitatem secundam.

/A 299/ Decimum obvians desideriis malis est: Non concupiscens rem proximi tui; per hoc removetur anima a tormento primo. Affirmantia sunt: Alter alterius honora portate (portata MS/A) et: Desidera aliis bona sicut tibi.

The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife

The third ban is 'Do not take the name of your God in vain.' Through it, the soul is restrained from the eighth punishment. The third precept is 'Fear God and respect His commandments: and 'Whoever fears God does good deeds.' Through this the soul ascends to the eighth happiness.

The fourth prohibiting command is 'Remember to sanctify the day of the Sabbath, you shall work for six days and rest on the seventh.' Through it, the soul is separated from the seventh punishment. The fourth precept is: 'You shall work not for the food that perishes, but for that which persists' etc.

The fifth established prohibition is 'Whoever curses her father or mother, shall perish in death'. And it detaches the soul from the sixth punishment. The fifth of the admonishing commands is: 'Honour your father and mother' and 'Take care of your parents.' Through this the soul is called to the sixth beatitude.

The sixth negative command is 'You shall not kill' and through this the soul is severed from the fifth punishment. The sixth precept that you have to follow is for all of us to delight in each other, both friends and enemies, so that we can offer our souls for each other as we would do for ourselves, and this provides the fifth glory.

The seventh negative command is 'Do not commit adultery' and through it the soul is separated from the fourth misery. The seventh command to observe and which is said to both men and women is 'Do not defraud each other' and 'Repay your debts to each other' and this carries the soul to the fourth rest.

The eighth prohibiting command is 'Do not steal' and through it the soul falls from the third torture. The eighth [command] to observe is 'Give alms' and 'the more a human should toil, working with her hands, so that she has can contribute what is necessary to the needful.' And through it, the soul is called to the third beatitude.

The ninth is 'Do not bear false witness' and this is a prohibiting commandment denying the soul the second punishment. The ninth precept is 'You shall tell the truth, everyone to her neighbour' and this strengthens the soul for the second happiness.

The tenth opposition to evil desires is 'Do not crave anything of your neighbours' and through this the soul is removed from the first torment. The affirmative commandments are 'The burdens of each shall be borne by the other' and 'Wish the others good that you wish to yourself.'

[7. The middle disposition of the soul]

Postquam, per Dei gratiam, iam diximus hominem tribus modis, scilicet interiorem, et exteriorem, et ex his compositum, et determinavimus decem genera felicitatis et decem cruciatus hominis interioris, iam dicendum est quod anima que pervenit ad medium inter hec duo et dicitur neutra, tandem /87ra/ perveniet ad felicitatem, saltem ad primam et minorem. Status enim anime que pervenit ad neutralitatem cum exiit a corpore non est sine fine, sed ad tempus finibilis, eo quod creata est sapiens naturaliter et bona, quare potius tendit ad id quod est de natura sua quam ad contrarium, nisi habeat impediens.

[8. Concluding prayer]

Deus autem spei et fidei, qui est dator largus affluenter sine improperatione repleat nos omni gaudio et benedictione et adimpleat petitiones nostras et faciat nos et omnes homines permanere in honore in quo facti sumus, scilicet in ymagine et similitudine sua, et faciat nos notos et amicos suis angelis felicibus, et absit ab eo quod comparemur iumentis insipientibus et affligamur in erumpnis et cruciatibus, sed induat nos armis lucis et faciat nos secum vivere et gaudere absque interpollatione et cessatione per infinita seculorum secula (secula seculorum A). Amen.

The Peregrinations of the Soul in the Afterlife

[7. The middle disposition of the soul]

After having spoken, thanks to God's grace, of the three ways of humans (that is, the inner and outer humans, and their composite) and having determined the ten kinds of happiness and the ten [kinds of] torture of the inner human, it is time to speak about the soul that reaches the middle term between these two, and it is called 'neutral.' Eventually, she will reach happiness, at least the first and lesser. Indeed, the condition of the soul that reaches neutrality after having abandoned the body is not endless, but finite in time, because she has been created as naturally wise and good. Therefore, she tends more strongly towards what conforms to her nature than its contrary, if there are no obstacles.

[8. Concluding prayer]

And may the God of hope and trust, Who is the giver, generously giving without any neglect, replenish us with all joy and bliss, and satisfy our requests and keep us and all humans in the honour in which we have been made – that is, in His image and likeness. And may He make us acquaintances and friends with his happy angels, and may it be far away from Him that we should be compared to foolish beasts of burden and be afflicted by distresses and tortures, but may He clothe us with the arms of light, and may He make us live and rejoice with Him without interruption or cessation for ever and ever. Amen.

Figures



Figure 1: Paris, BnF, Latin 3236A f.89

